A Grammatical Error Analysis in The Narrative Writing of the Third Semester of Pamulang University

Linda Meylinda

Universitas Pamulang, Tengerang Selatan, Banten, Indonesia
Email: meylindame@gmail.com

Abstrak

The study was conducted to find some accurate data. The researcher did some analysis through some assignments. The purposed assignment is in a form of a narrative text. It is in line with the goal of the study that the aim of the research is to explore on taxonomy of grammatical errors that were made by university students in their writing tasks. A narrative writing assignment is given as a tool to measure the students' taxonomy of grammatical errors. The research was conducted at Pamulang University. It is a grammar class that consisted of more than 30 students with different levels of grammar proficiency. However, the participant just involved 10 students who were chosen intentionally based on their previous score in their grammar subject. A qualitative study that focuses on a case study in this study was used. There are two instruments in this study. They are stimulated to recall interviews and students' narrative tasks. Those instruments will be used as a tool to get a piece of clear information about students' grammatical errors in their narrative assignments. The students were asked to be involved in an initial interview. Here the students were asked about their awareness of grammatical errors and narrative tasks. Next, they were asked to write a narrative task. The study started here. The researcher started analyzing the data. Finally, the participants were asked to be involved in a final interview about what they felt and their experience of their narrative assignment..

Keywords: Grammatical Error, Narrative Assignment, A Qualitative Study

Introduction

The importance of learning English is very crucial for many people. It cannot be separated from learning grammar. The grammar has been known as the exact rules that the students need to be follow. However, most of the students still have a difficulty in mastering this skill. There are many students have made some grammatical errors in making a sentence or an essay. Additionally, the students don't recognize some mistakes they made whether just a simple sentence or in a form of an essay.

The important of grammar has been also realized by most of students who want to perform excellent English both in their speaking and their writing task. It is because improving grammar knowledge can give some benefits in the students' performances. This issue gets challenging for university students in English department since they are expected to write a lot of academic reading texts such as journal and any other kinds of text which relate to their study.

Based on the writer's experience as a lecturer, most of the students still have difficulties in writing the text grammatically. This might happen because of some a variety of reasons such as their lack of awareness in mastering grammar. their lack of motivation, and their language proficiency (Grammar). In this case, the grammatical error that might be made by the students doesn't have any concerned by the teachers. That's why it might be the fact that the errors are easily still found.

On the other hand, all educators of English are expected to be aware of what students' need in improving their ability in grammar. The ability in mastering the grammar must be the crucial one to be considered, so this should be the most concerns in grammar skill to be taught. Besides, all educators are also expected to give students some exercises that deals with something which can improve the students' grammar. A Narrative text is considered as a good type of writing in analyzing students' grammar error.

According to Tomasello and Heron (1988), There are two strategies can be applied by the educator to use students' errors as a tool to improve students' knowledge grammar. They are Garden Path Method and Error Analysis. They have their own characteristics in their methods. Firstly, Garden Path Method asks the students themselves to correct their own grammatical error by encouraging them to overgeneralize the error. Secondly, the grammatical error will be corrected by the lecturer by putting the error into some grammatical error categories.

According to Burt and Kiparsky (1974), grammatical error is an error which is not suitable to the grammatical rules that may make writing become not good. Meanwhile, according to Ellis (1997) stated that grammar is traditionally concerned with the principles which determined the formation and interpretation of words, phrases and sentences. Therefore, the students are expected to recognize the grammatical errors and known how to solve the problems with them, especially in writing. It should be done because it will affect the result of their writing assignment.

In addition, according to Ho (2005), there are four taxonomies of errors that contain parts of speech. They are errors regarding nouns and noun groups, errors regarding verbs and verb groups, error regarding preposition, and error regarding sentence structure. They will be explored one by one in detail based on their accuracy.

Thus, this present study intends to explore students' grammatical error employed by the students in their narrative text, solving the problems and managing grammar error which are frequently used. Furthermore, the investigation of their perception dealing with the awareness of their error is also concerned.

Based on some previous experiences in grammar class, there are some problems that may cause the grammar error: The students have low awareness of studying grammar, they tend to be neglectful to fulfill assignment grammatically, especially in writing assignment, the students have low enthusiasm in being active in fulfilling writing assignment, especially narrative assignment, the students have less enthusiasm in fulfilling activity due to the lack of motivation. Most of them think that studying grammar is more boring than doing pleasure activity, the students are low in language proficiency, This factor mostly contributes to a wide range of failure in making the text grammatically. The last one is they cannot recognize the feature of linguistics such as a part of speech, punctuation, etc. Based on the problems identified previously, the objectives of this study are to investigate students' grammatical error used in the narrative writing and to investigate students' perception of the grammatical error used in the narrative writing.

Moreover, the result of this study is expected to provide benefit theoretically and practically. Theoretically: a. The result of the study is expected to enrich literature of review about students' grammatical error and students' perception. b. As a reference to other researches who want to take investigate students' grammatical error and students' perception as their study. Practically: a. The result of the study is expected to give much more information for lecturer about frequently students' grammatical error. Then, it can be used as guidance for any lecturer in teaching grammar class. Finally, the result can be applied in the classroom activity to improve students' grammar skill. B. The result of the study is expected to help students acquire a knowledge of grammar. Then, they can apply them to improve their writing skill.

There are some definitions of error come from some linguists. According to Dullay, error is the flawed side of learner speech or writing, those are part of conversation or composition that deviates from some selected norm of nature language performance. Meanwhile, according to Harmer as quoted by Brown, "Errors are part of the students" interlingua that is the version of the language which a learner has at any one stage of development, and which is continually reshaped as he or she aims toward full mastery.

In addition, Brown has different opinion. He gives more attention on the Interlingual competence of the speaker. He defines an error as noticeable deviation from the adult grammar of a native speaker reflecting the Interlingual competence of the learner.

Based on all definitions stated above, it can be concluded that error learner's flawed side of them caused by the factor of competence. It can be caused by some reasons, one of them is incompetency in linguistics system of the target language, so it will keep the students making error continually.

There are two types of error identified here as a reference of the study.
1. Global Error

It is a kind of error that has big impact to all parts of sentence. It may possibly impact communication flow. For example, the wrong position of syntax "The man was purchased by the TV yesterday." The correct order should be in the form of "The TV was purchased by the man yesterday."
2. Local Error

It is a kind of error that only impacts a little part of a sentence. It doesn't affect the communication flow. These errors can be in noun, adjective, verb form. For example, "I see two childs playing in the playground." In the sentence, the listener or reader still understand the meaning of it. The error of form of noun doesn't affect a lot to the meaning mostly.

In identifying the student"s errors in writing narrative text, the researcher used Corder steps with modification (1981). These are collection of the students writing, identification errors, classification of error, quantification of error, and explanation of error.

Error analysis can be defined as an independent source of valid data. It is because it provides the information of the students' error about the language target. The trainer or teacher can have sufficient information about the flaw side of the students. With them the teacher can improve or modify their teaching method in the class. It is in line with to Corder as quoted in Brown: "A learner"s error ... are significant in that they provide to the researcher and the learner is employing in the discovery of the language."

In addition, error analysis can be defined as the thing that was introduced by W.R. Lee in 1957. Then, its popularity spread out in the 1970s. It was established by Corder

and collegues in the field of error analysis in SLA (Second Language Acquisition). Besides, according to Crystal, "Error analysis in language teaching and learning is the study of the unacceptable forms produced by someone in learning a language, especially foreign language."

Based on the previous definitions of error analysis, the writer comes to a conclusion that error analysis is such a way to recognize students' error in order as information to a teacher to correct or improve teaching methodology.

One of methodologies in procedure of error comes from Corder. He suggested that there five steps in analyzing students' error, namely:

a. Collection of Sample of Learner Language

Corder suggested to decide a number of populations in the study. Then the population will be asked to do some examinations related to the issue of the study.

b. Identification of errors

The researcher takes an analysis of error that was made by the students. Comparing students' assignments with the correct sentences is a way to look for.

c. Description of Errror After identifying errors

The error will then be categorized into some types of error. It gives the information of classification of error thatas made by the students.

d. Description of Errros After identifying errors

This is the step of the procedure in error which the researcher will explain why the error occurs. It could be in the form of overgeneralization, ignorance of grammar, etc.

e. Evaluation of Errors

In the last step the researcher decides which one can be corrected or not. It is in line with the goal of evaluation of the error which has a function to distinct kind of error should be corrected.

One of the skills must be mastered by the learner of English is writing. It is not as an easy way to do. The students should make a practice and quite familiar with the rules of it. Based on its definition, the aim of writing can be seen clearly. Here are some following definitions of writing come from some experts.

The first definition comes from Hairstone, he said that writing is a tool for discovery, writing generates new ideas by helping us to make a connection and see relationship." Another definition of writing also comes from Raymond on his book:

"Writing is an unnatural Act, stated: Writing is more than a medium of communication. It is a way of remembering and a way of thinking as well ..., writing has a private importance as a tool for clear thinking, for sharpening our awareness of the realities around us, for solving problems and shaping arguments, for developing that short of knowledge – clear, specific, detailed – that makes human consciousness different from every other form of consciousness on earth. Writing also a way of learning. It is a way of finding out what we know and what we need to learn."

From the previous statements of its definition, it can be identified that writing is a tool of communication that can be learned by anyone to express their ides, feeling, etc. It should be in the form of learning continuously.

According to Oshima and Houge, "Narration is a story writing." It means that the orders of the event were depicted in the text to be in line with the aim of the text. The aim of the text of narrative is telling a story, entertaining, and so on. The other opinion about narrative text comes from mark Kathy Anderson, they said that the purpose of narrative is not only providing entertainment but also making the audience or readers think about

the issue. Several studies have been carried out to identify the taxonomy of errors in written English produced by speakers of other languages.

The Government Teacher training College, Ceylon (1972) conducted a survey of students' errors in English. The findings revealed that the errors made by student are mainly on articles, prepositions, possessive forms and word order. Therefore, they suggested that those new categories showed that students' errors have been shifted from those in twenty years ago. Therefore, they suggested that those new error taxonomies should be taken into consideration by the textbook writer for Ceilonese.

Wyatt (1973) studied the errors made by the prospective participants of the East African Certificate Examination. He identified fourteen categories of errors. The findings of his study showed that the major areas of errors were spelling(18.4%), sentence structure (16,6%), verb groups (15,2%) and noun groups (16.2%), punctuation (7.8%), whereas the other nine categories were less than five percent each Those were: Pronouns (1.6), adjectives (2.4), prepositions (4.1), intensifiers (0.6%), confusion and misuse of idioms (4.7%), contraction, abbreviation and informalities (2.6%), repetition (3.7%), clumsy or meaningless expression (2.4%) and carelessness (3.6%).

The same research was conducted by Thom (1985) to identify the taxonomy of errors produced by Vietnamese students and English teachers in Vietnam. He classified the errors into ten categories In comparison, the major categories of errors produced by students and teachers were: Spelling (15.38 : 11.42), lexical (23.84 : 34.23), verbal (18.46 : 11.42), prepositional (15.38 : 11.42), article (13.84 : 8.57), punctuation (5.38 : 8.57) and morphological (4.61 : 11.42). Meanwhile, both students andteachers produced fewer errors on three other categories namely concord (1.53 : 0), word order (0.76 : 0) and discourse (0.76 : 0). on error analysis still empasize the taxonomy of the errors, the cause of errors and their implication on language teaching. In Secondary School context, there have been two studies on error analysis on students' essay writing in Malaysian secondary school, and one in Jordanian context.

Maros et al (2007) found that the three most common errors produced by Jordanian students were the use of articles, subjectverb agreement, and copula be. Darus and Subramaniam (2009) studied the errors in the written English essays made by secondary school students in Malaysia. The findings of their study revealed there were fifteen categories of errors made by students, and the most common errors were singular/plural forms, tense, word choice, preposition, subject and verb agreement, and word order. Zawahreh et al (2012) studied errors made by ten graders in writing english essays and found that the most prominent errors were subject-verb agreement, insertion of preposition, verb omission, tense, and word choice.

Wijaya (2007) made a research of grammatical errors done by the fifth year students of Santa Theresia II on making interrogative sentences. He did the research based on classification of error suggested by Richard (1974). It had been revealed that most students had made some errors in the form of auxiliary. In addition, Victoria (2009) who used the theory of taxonomy of errors by Ho (2005), revealed that error analysis were usually found that the most mistakes occurred in the noun group, second is in the verb group, third is in the sentence structure, and the last is in the preposition.

Kirkgoz (2010) analyzed some written errors done by Turkish adult learner of English. He used the theory of taxonomy of errors proposed by Brown (1980). As the conclusion, he stated that there were 220 cases of interlingual errors. The error was also the highest number of all. Sa'diyah (2010) did a research about grammatical errors of students' movie review of bilingual magazine competition. The theory of error analysis

by Burt and Kiparsky (1974) was used in her study. From six types, she found four types of grammatical errors. The most dominant type is in the skeleton of English clauses in type of simple predicate missing be.

Thus, the study focused on a group of students in Pamulang University as Indonesian learners. Corder suggested that students' errors have positive value for teachers, student and researchers. Errors can give the indication for the teacher of how far the learner has come and what he still must learn. Meanwhile, in the part of student error is an instrument he uses to test out his hypothesis concerning the language he learns. In addition, the researchers use errors to support their hypothesis on the strategies and procedures used by learner to acquire the language (see Schachter and CelceMurcia, 1977: 144).

Method

This qualitative study was designed primarily as a case study in which grammatical error and perception of the students were documented and analyzed. It is assumed that this approach will be significant in getting deeper understanding of the object of the study. According to Creswell (2009, p.23), qualitative research is a tool to investigate and comprehend individual or group in social or human problem. According to Suparman (2009, p. 52) strongly remarked in his study that "a case study can be divined as an exploration of a bounded system or a case (or multiple case) over time through detailed, in-depth data collection involving multiple sources of information rich in context, the case might be a program, event, activity or individual." In other words, a case study will allow participants to discuss their experiences in depth regarding their type of grammatical error and their perception of it.

Mitchell (2012: 74) states:

"Within the field of sociology, qualitative methods tend to refer to ethnography, interviewing, and historical sociology. Ethnography involves an investigator's in depth immersion in the world of the people he or she studies and delineates a relationship between what people say and what people do; interviewing – conducted over an extended period or on a one – shot basis – privileges actors' subjectivities and definition of situation; and whereas ethnography and interviewing tend to rely on actors of the present moment, historical sociology mainly focuses on past events using written records contained in archives".

It means that within qualitative method, the researcher can analyze the projects more variety using the referring elements of qualitative method. It could be done by making interview, investigate and observe the records of literary works. Miles and Huberman (1984) concentrate:

"Qualitative data are attractive. They are a source of well-grounded, rich descriptions and explanations of processive occurring in local contexts. With qualitative data one can preserve chronological flow and derive full of explanations. They help the researcher go beyond initial and preconceptions and framework".

Based on the explanation above the writer concludes that with using qualitative data, the observer can analyze the data more attractively. It is because the qualitative data has a source of well-grounded. It can enrich and make the project full of explanations.

For this research, a case study approach has been used in order to gain deep information. A case study can be referred to an individual, a small group, an organization, community, or even a country (Punch, 2005; Richards, 2011). Merriam (1998, p. 3) also states that a case study can be defined as the "methods and techniques most suitable for

collecting and analyzing the data." Burns (1997) supports this, by arguing that case studies are used to gain in-depth understanding complete with meaning for the subject, focusing on process rather than outcome, on discovery other than confirmation. "You would use case study methods because they are deliberately designed to cover contextual conditions believing that they might be highly pertinent to your phenomenon of study" (Yin, 2003, p. 13).

The study was conducted at University of Pamulang on the third semester of 2019/2020 academic year of English Department. The research was conducted in February. There is a reason why the University of Pamulang is chosen as the place to conduct the study. It is because the researcher teaches in this university. Based on some experiences in teaching, it was found that the students still have difficulties in realizing some grammatical errors especially in narrative text. It can be seen from their previous grammar score that show if some of the students have grammar score at the range of 60-80. The results were not in line with a syllabus which asks the students to have ability more that.

The participants of the study are from the third semester of English department in university of Pamulang, South Tangerang. There are more 30 students in the class. However, the study only used 10 students as the participants who were chosen intentionally based on their grammar score in their previous semester. Then, the students were divided into two levels: low level of proficiency and high level of proficiency in grammar.

There are three different instruments in this study to gather data about students' grammatical error and their perception of their grammatical error: stimulated recall interview and students' narrative assignment. The first interview is an initial background interview for each participant to gather information about students' educational background, their previous experiences with English. This interview will be given before the process of writing the narrative text to build a rapport between the researcher and the participants including a discussion for future participation in the research. Then, the next instrument is a stimulated recall interview as the main instrument for data collection of the present study. Both interviews will be recorded and then transcribed.

The other instrument is students' narrative assignment. This is the second instrument of the study. It will be used to give more additional information of students' grammatical error and student perception in their writing narrative activities. The students will be asked to write a narrative text.

The analysis of all data was conducted qualitatively. The following below are the detail of how all the sources were analyzed.

1. Interview.

    In analyzing the data, there are two interviews, initial and stimulated recall interview, in which each interview will be conducted 24 hours after students write the narrative text. Then, they will be transcribed into manuscript. After that, the data will be analyzed and categorized based on taxonomy grammatical error. These categories are assumed very effectively in determining students' grammatical error and students' perception.

2. Student' narrative text.

    The data of students' narrative text will be confirmed during stimulated recall interview and finally will be categorized based on taxonomy grammatical error. The students will be expected to make notes on the given reading text during on the process of the text. then, they will be scanned as an evidence of grammatical error.

Result

  The result and analysis of the study are presented here through error classification categorized by Surface Taxonomy Categories. There were 10 students as participants who had got the narrative text assignment. They were chosen intentionally based on their previous score of grammar. The text is about "The last Holiday." Then a paragraph should be done by giving the students four questions. The students were firstly asked to do the assignment. Then the texts were analyzed in order to find out the errors made by the students through error classification. The following table shows the result of identification.

Table 1. The Recapitulation of Student's Error

No	Student's number	Error of Omission	Error of Addition	Error of Selection	Error of ordering
1	Student 1	2	2	1	-
2	Student 2	-	-	4	2
3	Student 3	3	3	1	1
4	Student 4	-	1	2	3
5	Student 5	5	4	3	5
6	Student 6	-	3	-	1
7	Student 7	-	2	1	-
8	Student 8	2	-	1	-
9	Student 9	3	-	-	1
10	Student 10	1	2	-	2
	Total =	15	18	12	17

Data Analysis

  Based on Surface Taxonomy Categories above, the study showed that the students' works had errors involving omission, addition, selection, and ordering. The following description examples are given below taken from student 2.

a. Error of Omission

  One of the students' work showed "There were dogs in the backyard." The correct sentence should be "There were some dogs in the backyard." The omission of the word "Some" had been done by the students.

b. Error of Addition

  One of the students' work showed "The dogs were are black and big." The correct sentence should be "The dogs were black and big." The addition of the word "are" did not need to do.

c. Error of Selection

  One of the students' work showed "My friends doesn't realize what had happened that day." The correct sentence should be "My friends didn't realize what had happened that day." The selection of the word "doesn't" had been done by the students.

d. Error of Ordering

  One of the students' work showed "The girl was coming from the city awesome." The correct sentence should be "The girl was coming from the awesome city." The order of the word is wrong.

Discussion

Based on the interview result of the study showed that the most of the students made errors into four types of error: omission, addition, selection and ordering. It can be concluded the reason of what they have done. There are some reasons in line with the errors the students made. The examples of them are followed below:

One of the reasons is the understanding about the rules of grammar is lack. Most of the students tend to generalize the rules that made them made some errors.

The next reason is the way of Indonesian rules are most applicated in all of English grammar. It made the students still confused about which grammar should be used. Here it is so clear based on the interview to the students that the use of tenses in English grammar seemed the most the difficult factors of the errors. They said that it might be because Indonesian grammar doesn't have it.

The reasons followed the error the students made is choosing the words in the right place. The most of students said that the rules were quite different from what were in Indonesian grammar. That made the students tended to make errors frequently.

Conclusion

To improve the students' competency in English grammar, the study analyzed students' errors made in narrative text assignment. The study used Corder's category to make the analysis clearly. The results showed that most of the students made most of the errors based on several reasons. The interviews and narrative text assignment are used here to get more data about the precise result of the study.

Narrative text might be different from the other kinds of the text in the assignment to the students. It can show the ability of the students' grammar in tenses, vocabulary, etc. the study showed that most of the students still made errors in them.

All of the result of analysis made the researcher come to the conclusion that the assignment of the narrative text can show students' errors grammatically. It can be a tool to the researcher to get more data on it. It is also useful to the researcher as an information to develop teaching method in grammar.

The interviews that were used to the study can make the students more aware to their own errors and the reasons behind them. The students indirectly reflected their own lack of the study. It can be a good reflection to be used in improving their own competency in grammar.

References

Brown, H. D. (2007). *Principles of Language and Teaching*. (Fifth ed.). Pearson Education, Inc: United States of America

Burt, M. K & Kiparsky. (1974). Error Analysis in the Adult EFL Classroom. TESOL Quarterly 9.1. 53-63. Mass: Newbury House

Creswell, J. W. (2008). Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research. New Jersey: Pearson Education.

Dalimunthe, L., & Haryadi, R. N. (2022). The Effect of Learning Methods and Vocabulary Mastery on English Speaking Ability. Lingua Educationist: International Journal of Language Education, 1(1), 1-7.

Ellis, R. (1997). Second Language Acquisition. New. York. Oxford University.

Darus, Saadiyah. (2009). Error Analysis of the Written English Essay of Secondary School Students in Malaysia (European journal of social sciences-volume 8, number 3) cited in www.eurojournals.com/ejss_8_3_12.pdf.

Haryadi, R. N. (2022). The Effect of Vocabulary Mastery and Learning Motivation towards Description Writing Ability. JEdu: Journal of English Education, 2(1), 88-94.

Ho, C. (2005). Empowering English Teachers to Grapple with Errors in Grammar. Singapore Nanyang University Press

Kirkgoz, Y. (2010). An analysis of written error of Turkish adult learner of English. electronic journal of procedia social and behavioral sciences. 13(1),5-12, from http://sciencedirect.com/pdf/Vol2_no1_pages_4352-4358.pdf

Richards, Jack C. 1971. A non-contrastive approach to error analysis. *English Language Teaching Journal. v25 n5 1971*

Tomasello, M and C. Heron. 1988. Down the garden path: Inducing and Correcting Overgeneralization errors in the foreign language Classroom. Applied Psycholinguistics. V9

Victoria, S.D. (2009). The grammatical mistake made by the English department of Petra Christian University. Thesis in Petra University Degree Program. Unpublished Thesis. Surabaya: Petra University

Wijaya, L. (2007). The grammatical errors made by the fifth-year pupils of Santa Theresia II in making interrogative sentence. Thesis in Petra University Degree Program. Unpublished Thesis. Surabaya: Petra University

Wyatt, Victor. 1973. An analysis of errors in composition writing. *English Language Teaching Journal. v27 n2 1973*.